LMS EVALUATION RUBRIC

By: Lane Hardy, Catherine Steeves, Shannon Maion & Emily Ansley

Scenario Summary:

Our group works for BCcampus, an organization that works for BC publicly funded post-secondary institutions by providing a means to connect programs and resources under a collaborative service delivery network.

Our group is considering the implementation of two different learning management systems (LMS). One of these LMSs is open-source, while the other is license-based, which will expire within one year. It should be mentioned that in our scenario, the IT department will cut the LMS support department in half within three months as it reorganizes the department.

Our group was tasked to create a rubric that can evaluate the two LMSs and decide which one to pursue (or perhaps choose yet another). We created the following rubric to help make this decision for BCcampus, as well as any other institution that needs help evaluating a LMS.

Rubric Rationale:

This rubric follows the SECTIONS model as outlined by Bates and Poole in their 2003 model. This model is the updated version of the ACTIONS model created by Bates in 1995. This model contains eight categories outlining important aspects to consider when choosing a learning management system (LMS). Within each category several questions have been included with a 4 point ranking scale. This model was chosen because it well organized and helps to put the decision into manageable pieces. To identify considerations within each category we used the guidelines provided by Bates and provided a rationale as to why each was important in the choice of an LMS (Bates, 2015). A 4 point scale was chosen to help the decision makers by provided a more detailed result.

\

Learning Management System (LMS) Evaluation Rubric

	4 **Exceeding Expectations**	3 **Meeting Expectations**	2 **Somewhat Meeting Expectations**	1 **Not Yet Meeting Expectations**	**Rationale**	**Notes**
Students: Demographics	The LMS is able to meet all the needs of learners with various and diverse technological skills	The LMS is able to meet the needs of most learners with diverse technological skills	The LMS is somewhat able to meet the needs of some learners with diverse technological skills but some will be left to struggle	The LMS does not take into account the different learning needs of students with diverse technological backgrounds	All students learn differently and it is also important to acknowledge that they will use the LMS with different amounts of experience. Learners from different countries/cultures will also have even more variance in technological skills	
Students: Access	The LMS has functionality for all students regardless of device and type of user Internet access (including mobile)	The LMS has functionality for all students regardless of device and user Internet access, except there is no mobile capability	The LMS has some functionality for all students regardless of user Internet access, however some devices may not be supported and there may or may not be mobile capability	The LMS has a limited range of users who can use it based upon type of device, user access and/or high speed capability only	Students will be accessing the LMS using a variety of devices and living in a variety of financial situations. LMS should account for these variances.	

Students: Learning Styles	The LMS takes into account all types of learning styles and does not favour some over others. A variety of media is able to be used	The LMS takes into account all types of learning styles, but may be limited in the variety of media available for use	The LMS is limited in supporting different learning styles, but a variety of media is available for use	The LMS is limited in supporting different learning styles and may be limited in the variety of media available for use	All learners are unique and there is literature to support that they learn better in some ways over others (e.g. visual vs. auditory). The rich variety of media that is available in this technological age can help support different learning styles.	
Ease of Use: Computer / Informational Literacy	Instructors and students will recognizes all affordances to make full use of the LMS without learning	Instructors and students will recognize enough affordances to make use of the LMS without much learning. However, there are some features that will require future learning	The LMS has some aspects that are familiar to most users, but will require some learning time by both instructors and students	The LMS has a steep learning curve for students and instructors on how to use it to its full capacity	If instructors and most importantly students are required to learn new skills in order to use the LMS, then this will take valuable time away from teaching the curriculum	
Ease of Use: Orientation	Within 20 minutes of use, students will be able to function effectively in the LMS environment	Within 20 minutes of use, students will be able to function effectively in the LMS environment, however some supplied informational videos are included	Within 40 minutes of use, students will be able to function effectively in the LMS environment, however some supplied informational videos are included	It will take over 60 minutes of use for students to be comfortable in the LMS environment. Informational videos are not supplied to help speed up the process	According to Bates (2014), students should be able to feel comfortable within 20 minutes of logging on to the LMS to familiarize themselves with the environment	

Ease of Use: Interface Design	The LMS' interface is highly intuitive for all users which takes into account learning styles and disabilities, software functionality and graphic design	The LMS' interface is highly intuitive for most users, but does not take into account learning styles and disabilities. However, software functionality and graphic design are sound	The LMS' interface is lacking in 1-2 areas regarding learning styles and disabilities, software functionality and graphic design	The LMS' interface has not taken into account learning styles and disabilities, and has major issues with software functionality and/or crude graphic design	The concept of design is crucial when designing a LMS. Developers need to take into account how humans respond to various affordances, learning disability adaptations, how the software performs on a daily basis, and how up-to-date it appears with its graphic design	
Ease of Use: Reliability	The LMS software is fully tested, not prone to crashes and is stable. 24/7 support is available for instructors and students	The LMS software is new and could be prone to crashes. 24/7 support is available for instructors and students	The LMS software is fully tested, not prone to crashes and is stable. However, support falls outside of peak operating periods for students	The LMS software is new and could be prone to crashes. 24/7 support is either not available or hours of support fall outside peak operating period for students	Having a stable LMS is crucial to prevent student frustration and ease of access. Help support should be available during the hours that most students would be using the LMS	
Cost: Uses minimal hours to design courses	The LMS system is intuitive and allows instructors to design courses efficiently	The LMS system is intuitive and allows instructors to design courses easily	The LMS system is intuitive and allows instructors to design courses with minor difficulties	The LMS system is intuitive and allows instructors to design courses with some difficulties	One financial cost is that of the instructors/designers time for creating online course materials	
Cost: Uses minimal hours to update courses	The LMS system is efficient and makes it easy to update course materials	The LMS system allows for easy updates to course materials	The LMS system makes it relatively easy to update courses	The LMS system does not allow for easy course updates	Having a platform that allows for easy and efficient updates reduces the amount of time needed by the instructor to keep the course current and relevant	

Cost: Includes all media necessary for design	The LMS contains all the necessary plug-ins[1] needed to provide high quality educational media	The LMS contains many necessary plug-ins[1] needed to provide high quality educational media	The LMS contains most of the necessary plug-ins[1] needed to provide high quality educational media	The LMS contains some of the necessary plug-ins[1] needed to provide high quality educational media	Investigate the different types of media that work with the LMS to decide if it is all inclusive or if you will need to purchase other programs
Cost: features vs financial cost	The financial cost of the LMS system provides exceptional value	The financial cost of the LMS system provides good value	The financial cost of the LMS system provides some value	The financial cost of the LMS system provides little value	For your purposes, does the LMS system provide an appropriate number of features for the cost of running the system
Teaching Function and Media Selection: Media Functions	The LMS has an extensive range of media and plug-ins[1] available	The LMS has a good range of media and plug-ins[1] available	The LMS has a range of media and plug-ins[1] available	The LMS has some media and plug-ins[1] available	To be functional in many different instructional scenarios the LMS should have multiple types of media available
Teaching Function and Media Selection: Instruction methods	The LMS is appropriate for all types of instruction methodology that will be used by instructors	The LMS is appropriate for most types of instruction methodology that will be used by instructors	The LMS allows for many types of instruction methodology that will be used by instructors	The LMS does not allow for the types of instruction methodology that will be used by instructors	The system should allow for different types of instruction so that it is useful to many different kinds of instructors
Teaching Function and Media Selection: Media and teaching design	The LMS allows for thoughtful, creative, and educational course design	The LMS allows for creative and educational course design	The LMS allows for educational course design	The LMS allows for some course design elements	The LMS should allow designers and instructors to follow the best practices for online course design

---

[1] A plug-in is an additional piece software that adds different features to a program. Plug-ins work to enhance the customization of the page.

Teaching Function and Media Selection: Teaching skills	The LMS promotes the development of skills needed for successful learning	The LMS provides the opportunity to develop the skills needed for successful learning	The LMS provides some level of skills development for successful learning	The LMS does not promote skills development for successful learning	The LMS should also help learners develop the skills needed to be successful in the field	
Interactivity: Tools	The LMS promotes interactivity between students, groups and instructors with a wide variety of tools.	The LMS has tools for supporting interactivity between students, groups and instructors.	The LMS has limited tools for supporting interactivity between students, groups and instructors.	The LMS does not have tools that promote interactivity between students, groups and instructors.	A LMS should engage the learners in discussions using a variety of methods.	
Interactivity: Collaboration and feedback	The LMS facilitates a large amount of student interaction, collaboration and instructor feedback in a variety of ways.	The LMS facilitates student interaction, collaboration and instructor feedback.	The LMS facilitates minimal interaction, collaboration and instructor feedback.	The LMS does not facilitate student interaction, collaboration and instructor feedback.	It is important that a LMS provide an opportunity for students and instructors to give and receive feedback. This increases the quality of interactions.	
Organizational: Implementation time	The LMS technical support department provides training and design help to the instructors. The LMS is user friendly and intuitive to use.	The LMS technical support department provides training and design help to the instructors.	The LMS technical support department provides limited training and design help to the instructors.	The LMS technical support department does not provide training and design help to the instructors.	Instructors have a limited time to spend on learning and implementing a new LMS.	

Organizational: Technical support	The LMS provides technical support to its users. Students and instructors can receive technical assistance in a timely manner.	The LMS provides technical support to its users. Students and instructors can receive technical assistance.	The LMS provides limited technical support to its users. Students and instructors may receive technical assistance for a limited time only.	The LMS does not provide technical support to its users.	The organization using the LMS and the instructor do not have the time or the budget to handle IT issues for instructors and students.	
Networking: Course Design	The LMS allows and encourages engagement and interaction with external connections. Social media is effectively integrated into the framework of the course	The LMS allows interaction with external connections. Social media usage is integrated into the framework of the course	The LMS allows for limited interaction with external connections. Social media is minimally integrated into the course.	The LMS does not allow for interaction with external connections. Social media is not integrated into the course.	The level at which students engage with subject specialists and professionals in the field can be beneficial to their overall success in the course.	
Security: Storage of Information	The LMS stores all information on a secure onsite server. It provides a secure, private, and controlled work place and access is by password only	The LMS stores most information on secure onsite servers.	The LMS stores some information on secure onsite servers but also uses "the cloud as well"	The LMS stores all information "to the cloud". It does not provide a secure, private and controlled work place. Information can potentially be accessed by other governments.	When student information is held outside of Canada, the potential for student information and communications could be shared	
Privacy: Policies and guidelines	The LMS has strict policies and guidelines in place that protect the privacy of students and staff	The LMS has policies and guidelines in place that protect the privacy of students and staff	The LMS has limited policies and guidelines in place to protect the privacy of students and staff	The LMS has no policies or guidelines in place to protect the privacy of students and staff	Detailed policies and guidelines on privacy must be in place when students and staff are utilizing various sites outside of the LMS.	

References:

Bates, A. W. (2015). *Teaching in a Digital Age: Guidelines for designing, teaching, and learning.* Retrieved from
http://opentextbc.ca/teachinginadigitalage/

Bates, A.W. & Poole, G. (2003). *Effective teaching with technology in higher education*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass Publishers.

Wikipedia. (2015) *Plug-in (computing)*. Retrieved from http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Plug-in_%28computing%29